

From: [Katherine Matsumoto-Gray](#)
To: [Katie Cattan](#); [Patricia Abdullah](#)
Subject: Re: 811/817 Norfolk HPB input
Date: Friday, July 02, 2010 01:23:17 PM

After reading the staff report, I have some additional comments on the Historic Site at 811/817 Norfolk.

As I understand it, the Planning Staff is recommending removal of the garage at 811/817 Norfolk from the Historic Sites Inventory because it was not constructed during the Mature Mining Era (1894-1930), the era during which the associated Historic Home was built. This is problematic for 2 main reasons:

1. First, the LMC does not specify that a Historic Site be representative of **one and only one** historic era that has made a significant impact to the broad patterns of our history. It states:

"c) **It is significant in local, regional or national history**, architecture, engineering or culture associated with at least one (1) of the following:

(i) An era that has made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history;"

Crucially, this criterion does not prohibit the preservation of accessory buildings that were built during a different significant era in Park City history than their associated main buildings. The criterion clearly states an "an era" of significance is sufficient for compliance with the historic site criteria, not *one consistent and delimited time period of significance*. The building in question was built during the significant era of Mining Decline & Emergence of Recreation Industry. For this reason, I strongly disagree with Staff's assessment that this structure does not meet Criterion C(i) of the Land Management Code, section 15-11-10.

Additionally, the Staff report states:

Typically, accessory structures were built in rear yards during the Mature Mining Era, *Garages were not built until the Mining Decline and Emergence of Recreational Activities Era (1931-1962)* of which this site is not associated with [emphasis added].

This is not evidence in support of removal of the structure, but instead must be interpreted as support for preservation of this garage. Since garages were not typically built until the Mining Decline & Emergence of Recreation Industry Era, we can not expect *any* historic garage on a Mature Mining Era site to be representative of the same time period as the primary home on the site. Furthermore, nowhere does the LMC specify that a site must be associated with only one historic era; we would expect many sites in our historic district to be associated with all of the Historic eras that they have lived through since being built.

This unique garage is representative of the type of construction that took place during the Mining Decline & Emergence of Recreation Industry Era. It was likely among the first garages in Park City as miners acquired the ability to purchase cars due to their low cost and wide availability. Ted Staker, the long time resident of 811

Norfolk was a miner, he parked his car in this garage, and his family owned and maintained this home through the Mature Mining Era, Mining Decline & Emergence of Recreation Industry Era, up to just last year when his wife, Ruth, passed on. We must not narrowly define our history and segment and separate the relevant eras of our past, when real Parkites lived and worked in these Historic Structures throughout their entire long lives. This garage is unique. As stated in the report, it is among the oldest garages in Park City. It deserves the respect and preservation it is afforded by the Land Management Code and Historic District Guidelines.

There are a number of other buildings from the Mining Decline Era currently on the Historic Sites Inventory. Reversing the historic status of this building would lead to a chain reaction, removing a number of historically significant sites from protection.

I feel that the spirit of the boom and bust economy is represented in the shed additions and accessory building/garage structures on these properties. On our street, similar to Sandridge, many of the houses have these out-building structures.

The two direct neighbors of 811 Norfolk both have garages on their properties. I know from personal experience of sharing my home with visitors and on historic tours that one of the things people enjoy most is the garage structure on our property. It's character and connection to past Parkites preserves the feeling of living in Park City during the mining era. These small buildings interspersed throughout the historic district are an important part of the intangible 'feel' of old town. Of the structures listed on the Historic Inventory, only 40 of these properties still have historic accessory buildings. In my preliminary research into these unique remaining buildings using the Historic Site Forms, I was able to establish dates of construction for just 21 of these buildings. Of these, 18 are from the Mining Decline Era, an era not typically represented by the main building on these sites. This indicates that the garage/out-building structure is highly characteristic of this era.

Preventing these historic buildings from protection and preservation simply because the house was built during a different era may lead to the destruction of all of these Historic Accessory Structures. I am personally aware of 2 of these accessory buildings that have been demolished in recent years, one on Empire and 10th, the other on Hillside and Prospect. The added charm to our historic district resulting from these characteristic structures is not quantifiable. We must protect them.

Landmark Structures deserve the strictest interpretation of the Historic District Guidelines. These accessory buildings are Landmark. They meet the LMC criteria, regardless of whether or not they were built during the same Historic Era as their associated main buildings.

2. Secondly, I am surprised that the above discussion is relevant to the evaluation of the garage with the present address 817 Norfolk. The Board may not be aware of the recent history of this Landmark Historic Site. The property at 811 Norfolk, as described in the Historic Site Form in your packet, no longer exists. 811 Norfolk, with the legal description of N1/2 LOT 2 & ALL LOTS 3 & 4 BLK 14 SNYDERS ADDITION TO PARK CITY, was purchased approximately one month ago by Mr. Jeff Love. He then sold Lot 4 plus 3 feet of lot 5 to Mr. Rod Ludlow. These two owners now own two separate properties: 811 Norfolk with a Landmark Historic House on it and the new parcel 817 Norfolk where the garage in question is located.

Therefore, I believe a new evaluation of the Historic Significance of 817 Norfolk would be necessary. It is no longer part of the Historic Site associated with the home at 811 Norfolk, due to Mr. Love and Mr. Ludow's recent deal. As a result of this division of the property, the claim that the garage is not representative of the Historic Era that the house at 811 Norfolk represents, is irrelevant. The two

buildings are no longer part of the same site.

Instead, the garage at 817 Norfolk stands alone as a quintessential example of Mining Decline construction. I ask the Historic Preservation Board to request a Historic Evaluation of the newly created property at 817 Norfolk. As I have stated above and in my earlier comment, this garage is a pristine example of the structures that remaining Parkites during the Decline were able to construct.

Please consider this additional information in evaluation of this property's historic status. I will reiterate here that our neighborhood is dedicated to the highest standards of historic preservation and this property is a cornerstone element of our street. Allowing the garage at 817 Norfolk to be removed from the historic inventory would be highly detrimental to the historic appeal of Lower Norfolk, a unique neighborhood even for the high preservation standards that exist in Park City.

Thank you for your consideration of these comments and for your service to our community. Please contact me if you would like any more details on my perspective for this unique property.

Katherine Matsumoto-Gray
823 Norfolk Avenue
(435) 901-0405

On Thu, Jul 1, 2010 at 8:27 PM, Katherine Matsumoto-Gray

<kmatsumotogray@gmail.com> wrote:

Please include this letter in the information for the HPB meeting on Wednesday July 7 pertaining to the evaluation of the historic status of the garage at 811 Norfolk.

Historic Preservation Board Members:

I am writing to contribute to the evaluation of historic status of the garage at 811 Norfolk. I live at 823 Norfolk Avenue, next door to the building in question. The garage is currently designated as an accessory building on the Landmark Historic Site at 811 Norfolk Avenue. I disagree with the proposal to remove this building from the Historic Sites Inventory. It is over 50 years old, no changes have been made to the historic structure of the building, and it was built during a significant era in Park City history, the beginning of the Mining Decline.

As you are aware, the three necessary criteria for Landmark Historic status are, from section 15-11-10 of Chapter 11 of the Land Management Code: (I have bolded the relevant criteria with which the building in question complies)

(1) **LANDMARK SITE.** Any Buildings (main, attached, detached, or public), Accessory Buildings, and/or Structures may be designated to the Historic Sites Inventory as a Landmark Site if the Planning Department finds it meets all the criteria listed below:

(a) It is at least fifty (50) years old or has achieved Significance in the past fifty (50) years if the Site is of exceptional importance to the community; and
(b) It retains its Historic Integrity in terms of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association as defined by the National Park Service for the National Register of Historic Places; and

(c) **It is significant in local, regional or national history,** architecture, engineering or culture associated with at least one (1) of the following:

(i) **An era that has made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history;**

(ii) The lives of Persons significant in the history of the community, state, region, or nation; or

(iii) The distinctive characteristics of type, period, or method of construction or the work of a notable architect or master craftsman.

I will address each of the requirements in order below,

(a) **It is at least 50 years old:** The date of construction of the building is not in question. Tax records clearly state that the garage was built in 1943. This date sets the age of the structure as 67 years old, well within the requirement of 50 years old for Landmark Historic Status.

(b) **It retains its Historic Integrity in terms of location design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling:** This building is particularly remarkable on this criterion. The structure retains all of its original materials with no additional structure or modifications. The garage is made of beautiful barn wood that has been protected for many years by the tar paper covering currently on the building. This garage is a unique example of the vernacular, craftsman building that miners added to their properties as they expanded their homes. Additionally, the evaluation of the 'feeling' the property in the Historic Site Form for the property states:

"The physical elements of the site, in combination, convey a sense of life in a western mining town of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries."

The sense of life in a western mining town referenced in this description includes the entire property's unique charms, crucially including the building in questions.

(c) **It is significant in local, regional or national history,** architecture, engineering or culture associated with at least one (1) of the following:

(i) **An era that has made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history:**

I believe this is the requirement in question for this historic garage. The issue, as explained to me, is that the garage was built during the 1940s, after the Mining Boom Era, which is narrowly defined in the Historic Sites Inventory as 1868-1893.

The other Era's listed in the Inventory are Mature Mining Era (1894-1930) and Mining Decline & Emergence of Recreation Industry (1931-1962). Although the garage at 811 Norfolk was not constructed during the Mining Boom Era, that alone does not disqualify it from being protected as historic. It was constructed during **"an era that has made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history."** It was constructed during the Mining Decline. This era is highly significant in our history as Parkites for a number of reasons.

The people who stayed in Park City during the 1940s were true Parkites who valued the history and community that Park City honors. They were convinced that Park City would return to prominence. The Stakers, who lived at 811 Norfolk

all of their married life, were some of those people. The Stakers were able to add the garage to their home in 1943. From what I understand from talking to my neighbors, the Stakers parked their car in this garage, probably a unique remaining garage from this early era of cars in Park City. Although mining was in its initial decline in the 1940s, the rest of the country was booming due to the war effort. Park City was stagnant; people were leaving town. The Stakers stayed and were likely among the only families who were able to build a structure in this difficult era in Park City history. This garage is a unique building exactly because it was built during this challenging economic time for our town. In preserving our history, we shouldn't recognize only the good times, but the hard times too. Without the hard times, we wouldn't be where we are today.

This era of the Mining Decline and the Emergence of the Recreation Industry is of growing importance as we move further into Park City's future. The events of the 1940s were integral and foundational to what Park City has become. If the mining economy hadn't changed, if we hadn't had that decline, Parkites may not have turned to the Recreation Industry. Although the boom times and the height of mining may be what we think of when we think of the eras that have contributed to our history, the Mining Decline was equally significant. If we do not act to preserve structures build during this time, we will suffer the short-sightedness that caused the existing loss of some of our historic district before the current commitment to preservation became the norm in Park City. Please consider the long term impacts of the precedence set by this decision. If we decide now, that the Mining Decline Era does not qualify as Historic, and effort is not made to preserve buildings representative of this era, we will not be able to reclaim this important part of our history. The remaining historic buildings of this era must be preserved today.

I believe it is clear that the garage at 811 Norfolk meets the requirements for Landmark Historic Status. It was built during a time in Park City that has led to where we are today in a significant way. The garage is representative of the building that went on during that difficult economic time; families would have only been able to add a small structure or shed addition if they were fortunate.

The feeling of our entire neighborhood retains the sense of the western mining town described for this property. Our neighborhood has maintained the highest standards of historic preservation. Our block, on the uphill side of Norfolk between 8th and 9th has no structure that is not historic. This is truly a unique neighborhood in this way and I believe that allowing the removal of the historic garage at 811/817 Norfolk from the Historic Inventory would begin the deterioration of our block's pristine record of historic preservation. Below, I have listed the sites on our street's uphill side from the Historic Site Inventory and their historic status. These are consecutive homes on our street all listed as significant or landmark:

- 803 Norfolk Avenue - Significant Site
- 811 Norfolk Avenue - Landmark Site
- 823 Norfolk Avenue - Landmark Site
- 827 Norfolk Avenue - Significant Site
- 835 Norfolk Avenue - Significant Site
- 843 Norfolk Avenue - Landmark Site
- 901 Norfolk Avenue - Significant Site

Thank you for your consideration of my comments. I have really appreciated the help and patience of all of the planning and other city staff during this process so far. Please feel free to contact me for further explanation of my issues with this building.

--

Katherine Matsumoto-Gray
University of Utah
Center for American Indian Languages
p (801) 587-0720
m (435) 901-0405
kmatsumotogray@gmail.com

--

Katherine Matsumoto-Gray
University of Utah
Center for American Indian Languages
(801) 587-0720
kmatsumotogray@gmail.com